



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

*Adrienne J. Tissier, Chair*  
San Mateo County

*Amy Rein Worth, Vice Chair*  
Cities of Contra Costa County

*Tom Azumbrado*  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

*Tom Bates*  
Cities of Alameda County

*David Campos*  
City and County of San Francisco

*Dave Cortese*  
Santa Clara County

*Bill Dodd*  
Napa County and Cities

*Dorene M. Giacomini*  
U.S. Department of Transportation

*Federal D. Glover*  
Contra Costa County

*Mark Green*  
Association of Bay Area Governments

*Scott Haggerty*  
Alameda County

*Anne W. Halsted*  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

*Steve Kinsey*  
Marin County and Cities

*Sam Liccardo*  
Cities of Santa Clara County

*Jake Mackenzie*  
Sonoma County and Cities

*Kevin Mullin*  
Cities of San Mateo County

*Bijan Sartipi*  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

*James P. Spering*  
Solano County and Cities

*Scott Wiener*  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

*Steve Heminger*  
Executive Director

*Ann Flemer*  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

*Andrew B. Fremier*  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE  
MINUTES  
FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 9, 2011

ATTENDANCE

Chair Mackenzie convened the meeting at 11:00 a.m. Committee members present were: Vice Chair Mullin, Commissioners Green, Halsted, Liccardo, and Spering. Commissioners Tissier and Worth were present in their ex-officio capacity. Other Commissioners present as ad hoc members of the Committee were Commissioners Bates, Cortese, Dodd, Sartipi, and Wiener.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Related to Agenda Item No. 2(a) (the Regional Rideshare & Bicycling Program) Commissioner Spering asked about the status of the funding agreement for rideshare services for Solano/Napa County. Ms. Crotty responded that staff has secured a funding agreement for this year, is currently working internally at looking at some long term strategic issues. The findings will be presented to the Rideshare Technical Advisory Committee this fall, and will come back to this Committee later in the year to discuss the findings and recommendations.

Upon motion of Commissioner Spering and second of Commissioner Halsted, the Committee approved the consent calendar unanimously:

- Minutes of July 8, 2011;
- Contract Amendment – Regional Rideshare & Bicycling Program: PB Americas, Inc. (\$150,000);
- Funding Agreement - Freeway Service Patrol Field Services: California Highway Patrol (\$64,000);
- SAFE Financials 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter June Unaudited.

Clipper® Options for Remaining Operators and Contract Actions

Ms. Crotty gave an overview of staff's proposal for the Clipper "Phase 3" expansion strategy for the remaining transit operators in the region. She noted that staff have a recommendation today to proceed with expansion to remaining ferry operations and will return later in the year with a recommendation for the remaining bus operators.

Ms. Lynn Valdivia, MTC staff, presented information detailing the implementation of Phase 3. She noted that staff recommends minimizing system complexity by organizing implementation into four Operator Groups and by significantly simplifying the fare policies (called Clipper business rules) that will be implemented for Phase 3. Staff will work with the Phase 3 transit agencies to help make the necessary changes to conform to a proposed set of business rules. These two

principles would streamline the implementation for the operator groups. Ms. Valdivia next described the two options for expanding the Clipper® program for bus operators. The options were to start with either the East Bay Operator Group or the Solano-Napa group. She described pros and cons for both of these options.

Commissioner Weiner expressed concern about requiring all of the operators to have only one type of pass that would be loadable. Ms. Valdivia stated that these requirements discussed today are only for Phase 3 of the program not existing operators, such as SFMTA. Commissioner Green expressed his support in implementing Clipper® in the East Bay first. Commissioner Spering expressed his support to expand to the remaining transit operators, and asked if implementing Solano and Napa Counties first would be better, and asked what the next step is. Mr. Steve Heminger, Executive Director, stated that it was important that we not lose our focus on our existing responsibilities for Clipper® operations. He noted that staff is proposing a completely different approach for the smaller systems. The next steps include a proposed contract action for the ferries (next on the agenda) and then a final recommendation for the Phase 3 bus operators in the coming months.

#### Clipper® Program Contract Actions

Commissioner Spering moved approval to authorize the Executive Director, or his designee to negotiate and enter into the following cooperative agreement and Clipper contract change order.

- Cooperative Agreement - Clipper Implementation: WETA (\$625,500);
- Clipper Change Order - WETA: Cubic Transportation Systems, Inc. (\$575,500).

Commissioner Halsted seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.

#### Clipper Title VI Draft Summary Report

Ms. Crotty presented the Draft Summary Title VI Report for Clipper®. She summarized the report for Committee members. The report summarizes Title VI reviews of fare media transitions for fare products required by Resolution 3866 to transition to Clipper®-only. Out of the thirty fare media transitions analyzed, six of them had potentially disparate impacts on Title VI protected persons. These potentially disparate impacts can be organized into four issues:

- (1) Concern that there may not be enough Clipper® retail vendors in certain neighborhoods. Staff worked with the Clipper® Contractor to resolve those issues or delayed the transition to address the problem;
- (2) Concern over inadequate enrollment opportunities for discount category patrons. Staff worked with the transit agencies to ensure that they would distribute the discount cards at their ticket offices;
- (3) Insufficient outreach was another concern. Staff dramatically increased the number of events and modified the approach for outreach to ensure that they were

conducted in culturally appropriate ways and with multilingual teams. Staff continues to conduct outreach and customer education in Title VI-protected communities; There was also concern about a potential barrier for acquiring the card due to the card fee. In 2006, MTC and the operators established a card acquisition fee of \$5.00. However, when the Clipper® brand was launched, the fee was waived, and has not been reinstated. Due to abuse of the negative balance policy, accelerated depletion of the card inventory, and lack of long term budget to cover card expense, there is an interest in restoring a card fee. Prior to such action, staff is required to define and consider alternatives. The current proposal is to reduce the card fee to \$3.00, with a \$2.00 minimum load.

Ms. Crotty noted that staff will be seeking public comment on the draft summary report during the fall. Staff will provide a summary of the report to the Policy Advisory Committee and work with community-based organizations to get feedback on key findings and proposed actions. Staff will return later in the calendar year with any final public comments on the draft report, and a recommendation regarding the reinstatement of the card fee.

Commissioner Green asked what outreach staff is doing in the minority communities particularly in Southern Alameda County. Ms. Crotty responded that as part of the customer outreach, staff did have extensive outreach to non-English speaking communities. MTC purchased quite a bit of media, both print and TV commercials in Chinese and Spanish.

Public Comment/Other Business/Next Meeting/Adjournment

Ms. Nina Rannels, Executive Director of Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA) expressed her support for implementing Clipper® on WETA.

There being no further business, Chair Mackenzie adjourned the meeting at 11:42 a.m.

